



**2019 – 2020**

**DISCUSSION PACKET**

***A Culture of Violence***

Rachel Schott, Class A  
Mike Worcester, Class AA

Minnesota State High School League  
2100 Freeway Boulevard  
Brooklyn Center, MN 55430-1735  
[www.mshsl.org](http://www.mshsl.org)

# Overview of Discussion

***“Problem-solving Discussion is an effort on the part of a small group to reach a solution to a problem through informal interchange of facts, inferences, and judgments. This method of discussion seeks consensus rather than majority rule. The focus of this event should be the encouragement of cooperation and critical thinking to arrive at the collective goal of better understanding and problem solving.” (MSHSL Rules and Policies Manual)***

The purpose and goal of the category of Discussion is to help students learn critical thinking skills, what constitutes quality research, effective group communication tactics, and problem-solving techniques. Discussion emphasizes that participants utilize consensus building tools to accomplish their goals. Encouraging a thoughtful exchange of substantive information, positive group interactions, and full participation by all should be the goal of every coach, student, and judge involved in this category. Game-playing and confrontational verbal (or non-verbal) tactics should be dissuaded.

## Overview of This Year’s Topic

American author Lewis Lapham once said: *“A society that presumes a norm of violence and celebrates aggression, whether in the subway, on the football field, or in the conduct of its business, cannot help making celebrities of the people who would destroy it.”* Has our fascination, or even perhaps, obsession, with violence and violent behavior damaged our global psyche to the point that we are unable to utilize other methods to solve disputes, other than violence? By defining violence broadly, the goal of this year’s topic is to explore the causes of, means, methods, and possible solutions to violent actions and behavior. This will certainly be a difficult topic for many participants, but is a conversation in which we must engage.

# TASK INFORMATION

## Tasks at Invitational Tournaments

While the Minnesota State High School League does not limit the use of topic areas used for Discussion at invitational speech tournaments, the Discussion Committee recommends the following schedule to give students experience with all parts of the outline:

- **Start of Regular Invitational Season – February 15: Section Topics**
- **February 16 – Last Regular Season Invitational: Subsection Topics**
- **State Tournament Tasks – Students should be prepared for tasks from both areas of the outline.**

**Tournament Managers Please Note:** Whether or not you choose to follow the above schedule, it is vital that you communicate to your participating schools which part(s) of the outline you will use and how you will be organizing your Discussion rounds.

## Tasks at Subsection and Section Tournaments

Tasks for subsection and section tournaments will follow the procedure instituted in the 2016 season – Tournaments will no longer receive a full slate of tasks from which to choose. Instead they will receive a set of four or five tasks for those tournaments. Those tasks will be date specific (unique to one or two sets of tournaments) and will not be repeated at other tournaments.

While the actual tasks shall not be shared beforehand with teams competing at subsection or section tournaments, the specific outline sub-points used will be sent with the sets and, following procedure established in 2018, **must** be communicated to all coaches in your sub and/or section within a time frame that affords adequate preparation for participating teams. For example—“Our [subsection/section] tournament will use Area 1, Sub-points A, C, D, J.”

## Tasks at State Tournament

State tournament tasks will follow the same procedure as previous seasons. Separate sets will be written for each day and chosen at random for each round of competition. Participants should be prepared for tasks from both areas of the outline.

# **2019 – 2020 MSHSL Discussion Topic Outline**

## ***A Culture of Violence***

### **I. TOP--DOWN ISSUES -- How Can Governments, Organizations, Etc. Address Issues of Violence. (Section Topics)**

- A. Protected Speech vs. Hate Speech (who decides which is which?).
- B. Gender- Based Violence (spousal abuse, LGBTQ violence).
- C. Racially-based Violence (refugees, *cultural distinctions*, scapegoating)
- D. Religious-Based/Inspired Violence (distinctions between religious traditions, accountability within traditions).
- E. Social media regulation (who is responsible for regulating content?).
- F. Interpersonal Violence (child abuse, mental health, exposure to violence, PTSD).
- G. Sports/activities - inspired violence (why is violence in sports tolerated/celebrated?).
- H. Law enforcement / community relations violence (how to build trust and ensure accountability).
- I. American firearms culture vs. other nations' approach.
- J. Political/governmental civility (how much is too much?).

### **II. BOTTOM--UP ISSUES -- How Can Individuals/Groups Address Issues of Violence? (Subsection Topics)**

- A. Micro-aggressions, safe spaces, tolerance vs. acceptance? (the psychological conflict of "my reality is not your reality").
- B. Protected Speech vs. Hate Speech (is "free speech" free from consequences?).
- C. Gender-Based Violence.
- D. Race-Based Violence.
- E. Religious-Based/Inspired Violence.
- F. Social Media Use/Abuse.
- G. Interpersonal Violence (child abuse, mental health, exposure to violence, PTSD).
- H. Sports/activities - inspired violence (why is it tolerated and even encouraged?).
- I. Law enforcement / community relations violence.
- J. American firearms culture vs. other nations' approach.

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

The bibliography is intended as a starting point for researching this topic, with each sub-point having at least three citations. General interest web sites are listed at the end. It is not meant to be exhaustive and represents a fraction of the resources available to prepare for Discussion rounds. A source listed in one area may be applicable to other subtopic points.

## **I. TOP--DOWN ISSUES -- How Can Governments, Organizations, Etc. Address Issues of Violence. (Section Topics)**

### A. Protected Speech vs. Hate Speech (who decides which is which?)

1. Should Hate Speech Be Free Speech? *Psychology Today*, 29 March 2019. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-superhuman-mind/201903/should-hate-speech-be-free-speech>
2. Where One Hears Free Speech, Another Hears Hate Speech. *Voice of America News*, 10 August 2018. <https://www.voanews.com/student-union/where-one-hears-free-speech-another-hears-hate-speech>
3. Don't Use These Free-Speech Arguments Ever Again: Most speech, hateful or not, is protected by the Constitution. *The Atlantic*, 22 August 2019. <https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2019/08/free-speech-cliches-media-should-stop-using/596506/>
4. 6 Major U.S. Supreme Court Hate Cases. *ThoughtCo*, 18 July 2019. <https://www.thoughtco.com/hate-speech-cases-721215>
5. Free speech or censorship? Social media litigation is a hot legal battleground. *ABA Journal*. 1 April 2019 <http://www.abajournal.com/magazine/article/social-clashes-digital-free-speech>

### B Sexual/Gender- Based Violence (spousal abuse, LGBTQ violence, .

1. Sexual and Gender Based Violence. *United Nations High Commission on Refugees*. <https://www.unhcr.org/en-us/sexual-and-gender-based-violence.html>
2. Gender-Based Violence in the U.S. *Journal of the American Anthropological Association*. 3 April 2018. <http://www.americananthropologist.org/2018/04/03/gender-based-violence-in-the-us/>
3. Victims of Sexual Violence: Statistics. *Rape, Abuse & Incest National Network (RAINN)*. <https://www.rainn.org/statistics/victims-sexual-violence>
4. Male Gender-Based Violence: A Silent Crisis. *Overseas Development Institute*. 23 June 2014. <https://www.odi.org/blogs/8502-male-gender-based-violence-silent-crisis>

### C. Racially-Based Violence (refugees, cultural distinctions, scapegoating).

1. Hate Crimes Statistics, 2017. U.S. Department of Justice. (Can be used for other areas of the outline.) <https://www.justice.gov/hatecrimes/hate-crime-statistics>

2. Strategies for Reducing Racial and Ethnic Prejudice: Essential Principles. *Southern Poverty Law Center*. <https://www.tolerance.org/professional-development/strategies-for-reducing-racial-and-ethnic-prejudice-essential-principles>
3. Ending Violence Against Native Women. *Indian Law Resource Center*. <https://indianlaw.org/issue/ending-violence-against-native-women> (One example of culturally specific violence.)
4. Blood for Soil: The Fatal Temptations of Ethnic Politics. *Foreign Affairs*. March/April 2019. <https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2019-02-12/blood-soil>

D Religious-Based/Inspired Violence (distinctions between religious traditions, *accountability within traditions*).

1. Violence in the Name of God. *Psychology Today*. 28 December 2015. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/am-i-right/201512/violence-in-the-name-god>
2. Religiously Motivated Violence. *Oxford Bibliographies*. 27 February 2019. <https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199743292/obo-9780199743292-0168.xml>
3. A Closer Look at How Religious Restrictions Have Risen Around the World. *PEW Research Center on Religion & Public Life*, 15 July 2019. <https://www.pewforum.org/2019/07/15/a-closer-look-at-how-religious-restrictions-have-risen-around-the-world/>
4. Plan of Action for Religious Leaders and Actors To Prevent Incitement to Violence That Could Lead to Atrocity Crimes. *United Nations Office on Genocide Prevention and the Responsibility To Protect*, July 2017 [large pdf file] <https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/Plan%20of%20Action%20Advanced%20Copy.pdf>

E. Social media regulation (who is responsible for regulating content?)

1. Hate Speech on Social Media: Global Comparisons. *Council on Foreign Relations*. 7 June 2019. <https://www.cfr.org/background/hate-speech-social-media-global-comparisons>
2. Regulate social media now. The future of democracy is at stake. Applebaum, Anne. *Washington Post*, 1 February 2019. [https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/global-opinions/regulate-social-media-now-the-future-of-democracy-is-at-stake/2019/02/01/781db48c-2636-11e9-90cd-dedb0c92dc17\\_story.html?noredirect=on](https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/global-opinions/regulate-social-media-now-the-future-of-democracy-is-at-stake/2019/02/01/781db48c-2636-11e9-90cd-dedb0c92dc17_story.html?noredirect=on)
3. Why the Government Should Not Regulate Content Moderation of Social Media. *CATO Institute*, 9 April 2019. <https://www.cato.org/publications/policy-analysis/why-government-should-not-regulate-content-moderation-social-media>
4. Social media: How can governments regulate it? *BBC News*, 8 April 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/technology-47135058>

#### F. Interpersonal Violence (child abuse, mental health, exposure to violence, PTSD)

1. Definitions of Child Abuse and Neglect in Federal Law. *U.S. Department of Health & Human Services*. <https://www.childwelfare.gov/topics/can/defining/federal/>
2. Preventing Child Abuse & Neglect, *Centers For Disease Control & Prevention*. <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/childabuseandneglect/fastfact.html>
3. Mental Health Myths and Facts. *U.S. Department of Health & Human Services*. <https://www.mentalhealth.gov/basics/mental-health-myths-facts>
4. Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder. *Psychology Today*. 7 February 2019. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/conditions/post-traumatic-stress-disorder>

#### G Sports/Activities - inspired violence (why is violence in sports tolerated/celebrated?).

1. The Psychology Of Violence In Sports — On The Field And In The Stands. *WBUR*, 28 March 2014. <https://www.wbur.org/cognoscenti/2014/03/18/sports-violence-psychology-leonard-l-glass>
2. Give the Ref a Gavel. *New York Times*, 7 March 2012. (A bit dated but still relevant to the current debate.) <https://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/08/opinion/prosecute-excess-violence-in-sports.html>
3. Violence and Aggression in Sports: An In-Depth Look. *Bleacher Report*. 23 March 2010 (Also dated but gives good context.) <https://bleacherreport.com/articles/367924-violence-and-aggression-in-sports-an-in-depth-look-part-one>
4. Fair Game? *The Economist*. 15 January 2015. <https://www.economist.com/international/2015/01/15/fair-game>

#### H. Law enforcement / community relations violence

1. There are huge racial disparities in how US police use force. *VOX*, 14 October 2018. <https://www.vox.com/identities/2016/8/13/17938186/police-shootings-killings-racism-racial-disparities>
2. A new high school will have sleek classrooms — and places to hide from a mass shooter. *Washington Post*. 22 August 2019. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/education/2019/08/22/new-high-school-will-have-sleek-classrooms-places-hide-mass-shooter/>
3. Building Trust Between Police and the Communities They Serve. *National League of Cities*, 20 November 2016. <https://www.nlc.org/article/building-trust-between-police-and-the-communities-they-serve>
4. Body-Worn Cameras: What the Evidence Tells Us. *National Institute of Justice*. 14 November 2018. <https://nij.ojp.gov/topics/articles/body-worn-cameras-what-evidence-tells-us>

#### I. American firearms culture vs. other nations' approach.

1. Epidemiology in Firearm Violence Prevention. *American Academy of Pediatrics*, August 2018. <https://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/142/2/e20181501>

2. How to Reduce Gun Violence: Ask Some Scientists. *Wired*, 6 August 2019. <https://www.wired.com/story/how-to-reduce-gun-violence-ask-some-scientists/>
3. Deaths From Gun Violence: How The U.S. Compares With The Rest Of The World. *NPR News*, November 9, 2018. <https://www.npr.org/sections/goatsandsoda/2018/11/09/666209430/deaths-from-gun-violence-how-the-u-s-compares-with-the-rest-of-the-world>
4. America's Gun Culture In Charts. *BBC News*. 5 August 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-41488081>

#### J. Political/Governmental Incivility (how much is too much?)

1. America's incivility has reached a crisis point. *Des Moines Register*, 22 June 2018. <https://www.desmoinesregister.com/story/opinion/columnists/iowa-view/2018/06/22/americas-incivility-has-reached-crisis-point/722493002/>
2. Civility will not fix our democracy — only politics can. *The Hill*, 31 October 2018. <https://thehill.com/opinion/campaign/413351-civility-will-not-fix-our-democracy-only-politics-can>
3. The Political Uses and Abuses of Civility and Incivility. Oxford Handbooks Online. <https://www.oxfordhandbooks.com/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199793471.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780199793471-e-79>
4. Roughly 80 Percent Of Americans Scared Political Incivility Will Lead To More Violence. *NPR News*, 1 November 2018. <https://www.npr.org/2018/11/01/663123135/roughly-80-percent-of-americans-scared-political-incivility-will-lead-to-more-vi>

## **II. BOTTOM--UP ISSUES -- How Can Individuals/Groups Address Issues of Violence? (Subsection Topics)**

- A. Micro-aggressions, safe spaces, tolerance vs. acceptance? (the psychological conflict of "my reality is not your reality")
  1. Microaggressions don't just 'hurt your feelings'. *USA Today*, 28 February 2018. <https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/2018/02/28/what-microaggressions-small-slights-serious-consequences/362754002/>
  2. Harvard Law dean compares microaggressions to violence, sexual assault. *Washington Examiner*. 28 December 2015. <https://www.washingtonexaminer.com/harvard-law-dean-compares-microaggressions-to-violence-sexual-assault>
  3. The scientific evidence for microaggressions is weak and we should drop the term. *Research Digest*, 16 March 2017. <https://digest.bps.org.uk/2017/03/16/the-scientific-evidence-for-microaggressions-is-weak-and-we-should-drop-the-term-argues-review-author/>
  4. After Charlottesville, how we define tolerance becomes a key question. *The Conversation*. 1 October 2017.



<http://theconversation.com/after-charlottesville-how-we-define-tolerance-becomes-a-key-question-83793>

B. Protected Speech vs. Hate Speech (is “free speech” free from consequences?)

1. Speaking Your Mind, When Free Speech Has Consequences. *Freedom Forum*, 16 December 2017. <https://www.freedomforuminstitute.org/2017/09/16/speaking-your-mind-when-free-speech-has-consequences/>
2. Free speech doesn't mean speech free from all consequences. *NBC News*, 6 July 2019. <https://www.nbcnews.com/think/opinion/free-speech-doesn-t-mean-speech-free-all-consequences-despite-ncna1026911>
3. The myth of the free speech crisis. *The Guardian*, 3 September 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/sep/03/the-myth-of-the-free-speech-crisis>
4. Why Americans Get to Talk So Much: The Making of Free Speech Law. *American Historical Association Perspectives on History*. 25 January 2016.

C. Gender-Based Violence

1. What Does That Mean? Gender-based Violence. *Women For Women*, 21 November 2017. <https://www.womenforwomen.org/blogs/series-what-does-mean-gender-based-violence>
2. Why should you care about gender-based violence? *World Vision*, 22 November 2017. <https://www.worldvisionphilanthropy.org/news/gender-based-violence>
3. Promoting gender equality to prevent violence against women. *World Health Organization*. [https://www.who.int/violence\\_injury\\_prevention/violence/gender.pdf](https://www.who.int/violence_injury_prevention/violence/gender.pdf)
4. Helping LGBTQ students feel safe. *Promoting Relationships & Eliminating Violence Network (PREVNet)*. 2019. <https://www.prevnet.ca/bullying/educators/helping-lgbtq-students-feel-safe>

D. Race-Based Violence

1. Gun Violence and the Minority Experience. *National Council on Family Relations*, 10 January 2019. <https://www.ncfr.org/ncfr-report/winter-2018/gun-violence-and-minority-experience>
2. The Impact of Racism and Violence on Communities. *The National Academies of Science, Engineering, and Medicine*, 2017. <https://www.nap.edu/read/23661/chapter/3>
3. Racism and Violence in America. *Psychology Today*, 11 July 2016. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-five-percent/201607/racism-and-violence-in-america>
4. Study: Exposure to violent videos online may lead to mental health issues. *USC News*. 10 June 2019. <https://news.usc.edu/157912/violent-videos-racial-ethnic-depression-ptsd/>

#### E. Religious-Based/Inspired Violence

1. Religious violence is on the rise. What can faith-based communities do about it? *World Economic Forum*, 25 February 2019. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2019/02/how-should-faith-communities-halt-the-rise-in-religious-violence/>
2. When Religion Promotes Violence. *Psychology Today*, 31 January 2018. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-pursuit-peace/201801/when-religion-promotes-violence>
3. Does Religion Really Cause Violence? *Research Digest*, 10 May 2019. <https://digest.bps.org.uk/2019/05/10/does-religion-really-cause-violence-a-new-review-suggests-any-link-is-far-from-straightforward/>

#### F. Social Media Use/Abuse

1. Tearing Down Social Platforms Like Gab Won't Stop the Violence. *Foundation For Economic Education*, 28 November 2018. <https://fee.org/articles/tearing-down-social-platforms-like-gab-wont-stop-the-violence/>
2. What Can Social Media Do to Prevent the Spread of Violence? *Make Tech Easier*, 22 March 2019. <https://www.maketecheasier.com/what-can-social-media-do-to-prevent-the-spread-of-violence/>
3. Does Social Media Induce Violence Among Youth? *International Business Times*, 13 August 2017, <https://www.ibtimes.com/does-social-media-induce-violence-among-youth-2577472>
4. How internet "echo chambers" lead to faster radicalization. *MarketPlace*. 20 March 2019. <https://www.marketplace.org/2019/03/20/how-internet-echo-chambers-lead-to-faster-radicalization/>

#### G. Interpersonal Violence (child abuse, mental health, exposure to violence, PTSD)

1. Violence and mental illness: what is the true story? *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health*, V. 70, #3. <https://jech.bmj.com/content/70/3/223>
2. The Dangers of Linking Gun Violence and Mental Illness. *Time*, 7 August 2019. <https://time.com/5645747/gun-violence-mental-illness/>
3. Violent Media and Aggressive Behavior in Children: Does watching violence on TV, in movies, or video games promote aggression? *Psychology Today*, 8 January 2018. [https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-baby-scientist/201801/violent-m%C3%A9dia-and-aggressive-behavior-in-children](https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-baby-scientist/201801/violent-media-and-aggressive-behavior-in-children)
4. Preventing Teen Dating Violence. *Center for Disease Control and Prevention*. 12 March 2019. <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/intimatepartnerviolence/teendatingviolence/fastfact.html>

#### H. Sports/activities - inspired violence (why is it tolerated and even encouraged?)

1. Violence in Sports: It Matters To Your Children. LifeOpedia.com.  
<http://www.lifeopedia.com/violence-in-sports/>
2. When sports fans fight: Why violence in the stands, online rage are spreading. Seattle Times, 17 July 2015.  
<https://www.seattletimes.com/sports/seahawks/when-fans-fight-why-violence-in-the-stands-and-online-rage-is-spreading/>
3. The Psychology Of Violence In Sports — On The Field And In The Stands. *WBUR-TV*, 18 March 2014.  
<https://www.wbur.org/cognoscenti/2014/03/18/sports-violence-psychology-leonard-l-glass>
4. Parental Violence in Youth Sports: Facts, Myths, and Videotape. *Rutgers*. (dated citations but relevant to the topic)  
<https://youthsports.rutgers.edu/program-areas/2-uncategorised/45-parental-violence-in-youth-sports-facts-myths-and-videotape>

#### I. Law enforcement / community relations violence

1. Building Bridges Between Police and Communities. *VERA Institute*.  
<https://www.vera.org/securing-equal-justice/building-bridges-between-police-and-communities>
2. Is the police-community relationship in America beyond repair? *Washington Post*, 8 July 2016. [https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/is-the-police-community-relationship-in-america-beyond-repair/2016/07/08/595c638c-454b-11e6-bc99-7d269f8719b1\\_story.html?noredirect=on](https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/is-the-police-community-relationship-in-america-beyond-repair/2016/07/08/595c638c-454b-11e6-bc99-7d269f8719b1_story.html?noredirect=on)
3. Who Will Hold the Police Accountable? *The Atlantic*, 25 July 2019.  
<https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2019/07/battle-over-police-accountability/594484/>
4. Race and Police Shootings: What New Research Says. *CityLab*. 6 August 2019  
<https://www.citylab.com/equity/2019/08/police-officer-shootings-gun-violence-racial-bias-crime-data/595528/>

#### J. American firearms culture vs. other nations' approach

1. A Real Long-Term Solution to Gun Violence. *Washington Monthly*, November/December 2018. <https://washingtonmonthly.com/magazine/november-december-2018/a-real-longterm-solution-to-gun-violence/>
2. Gun Violence: Prediction, Prevention, and Policy. *American Psychological Association*. <https://www.apa.org/pubs/info/reports/gun-violence-prevention>
3. Solutions to America's Gun Violence Epidemic - Academic Researchers Weigh In. *Joyce Foundation*, 19 June 2019.  
[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1m\\_4UnnJ12wU52-tcH6aQh-J0iFm7WXtUC2oV1UYZ-zY/edit](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1m_4UnnJ12wU52-tcH6aQh-J0iFm7WXtUC2oV1UYZ-zY/edit)

4. The Facts on Media Violence. *Fact Check Dot Org*, 8 March 2018.  
<https://www.factcheck.org/2018/03/facts-media-violence/>

### **Web-bases Resources**

<https://www.mtsu.edu/first-amendment/>

<https://www.unicef.org> (studies and articles addressing violence against children)

<https://www.cfr.org/interactive/global-conflict-tracker/?category=us> Council on Foreign  
Relations Global Conflict Tracker

<https://www.nsvrc.org/> National Sexual Violence Resource Center

=====

If coaches have any questions regarding outline content, feel free to contact us:

- Rachel Schott – [rachelgschott@gmail.com](mailto:rachelgschott@gmail.com)
- Mike Worcester – [mrmike55321@yahoo.com](mailto:mrmike55321@yahoo.com)